

# A History of Self-Consciousness: From Augustine to Kant

PHIL 93267 01 (19835)

Profs. Cory & Kraus

Mondays 12:30-3:15, Fall 2018



Las Meninas, 1656, Diego Velázquez

## Course Description

Questions about self-consciousness and subjectivity are not a modern invention, but have been a staple of philosophical reflection across the history of philosophy. In this course, we will trace the developments in philosophical debates about self-consciousness, focusing on three competing pre-modern approaches (Augustine, Avicenna, Aquinas, and Ockham), and three competing early modern and modern approaches (Leibniz, Locke, Hume, and Kant).

## Contact Info

Therese Cory, Malloy 330, xt. 16805, [tcory@nd.edu](mailto:tcory@nd.edu).

Office hours M 11:15am-12:15pm or by appointment

Katharina Kraus, Malloy 309, xt. 18163, [kkraus2@nd.edu](mailto:kkraus2@nd.edu).

Office hours T 11:00am-12:00pm or by appointment

## **Texts Available for Purchase at the Bookstore**

### **Required Texts**

- Augustine, *On the Trinity [De Trinitate]*, translated by Mathews (Cambridge, 2002). ISBN 0521796652
- Cory, Therese. *Aquinas on Human Self-Knowledge* (Cambridge, 2015 Paperback). ISBN 1316502333
- Kaukua, Jari. *Self-Awareness in Islamic Thought: Avicenna and Beyond* (Cambridge, 2018 Paperback). ISBN 1107460808
- Locke, John. *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding, Clarendon Edition* (Oxford, 1979). ISBN 0198245955
- Kant, Immanuel. *Critique of Pure Reason*. Translated by Guyer and Wood (Cambridge, 1999). ISBN 0521657296

### **Recommended / Optional**

- Renz, Ursula, ed. *Self-Knowledge: A History*. Oxford Philosophical Concepts (Oxford, 2016). ISBN 0190226420
- Thiel, Udo. *The Early Modern Subject: Self-Consciousness and Personal Identity from Descartes to Hume*. (Oxford, 2014, paperback). ISBN 0198704402

### **Course requirements**

- Participation in seminar discussions: 20%
- Term paper, approx 20-30 pages: 80%

### **Policies and expectations**

Students, including auditors, are expected to attend all seminar sessions, to prepare the readings, and to participate actively in the classroom discussions. In case of absences, official excuses must be obtained via the standard University procedure. This class follows Notre Dame's binding Honor Code (<http://honorcode.nd.edu/the-honor-code/>).

### **Term paper instructions**

At the end of the course, the students will be expected to write a term paper of 20-30 pages in which they engage with a topic of their choice related to the course topic. The aim of this paper is to produce a research paper that approaches the standards of a research article in philosophy and that adequately considers the relevant secondary literature. You should talk to one of us about your topic by Oct. 31 at the latest. You will be given the opportunity to revise the paper. If you desire to do so, you should submit a draft by Nov. 21, so that I can give you my feedback in due time. The paper is due on Dec. 10, 12:30 pm. Grade will be based on coherence of the thesis, strength of the argument, adequate use of relevant primary and secondary texts, clarity of structure, and correctness of form. The assignments should be handed in as Word document (.doc or .docx; Times New Roman, 12 pt., spacing 1.5) by email.

\*\*\* Timely completion of the assignment is highly important! Due dates are absolutely strict! Late assignments will be penalized by being marked down 2 percentage points per day (24 hours).\*\*\*

## Course Readings and Bibliography

### Primary Texts

- Plato, *Alcibiades 1* [scan]
- Aristotle, *De anima* 3.4 [scan]
- Plotinus, *Ennead* 5.3 [scan]
- Augustine, *De Trinitate* bks 9-10, trans. Mathews
- Avicenna, *The Soul* 1.1 and 5.7, trans. McGinnis and Reisman [scan]
- Aquinas, *De veritate* q. 10, aa. 8-10, *Summa theologiae* Ia, q. 87, aa. 1-4, and additional short excerpts. Latin available at [www.corpusthomisticum.org](http://www.corpusthomisticum.org); English or side-by-side Latin/English available at <http://dhspriority.org/thomas>)
- Peter John Olivi, *In Sententiarum* II, qq. 76 & 79, trans. Brower-Toland [scan]
- William of Ockham, *Ordinatio, Prologue*, q. 1, a. 1, selections, trans. Brower-Toland [scan]; *Quodlibet* 1, q. 15, and *Quodlibet* 2, q. 12, trans. Freddoso [scan]; *Reportatio* 2,17, trans. Brower-Toland [scan]
- Walter Chatton, *Reportatio et Lectura*, Prologue, Q. 2, a.5, trans. Brower-Toland [Scan]
- Descartes, *Meditations* [Online available]
- [Locke, \*An Essay Concerning Human Understanding\*](#)
- Hume, *An Enquiry Concerning Human Understanding* [scan]
- Hume, *A Treatise on Human Nature* [scan]
- Leibniz, *New Essays on Human Understanding* [scan]
- Leibniz, *Monadology* [online available; scan]
- [Kant, \*Critique of Pure Reason\* \[translation Guyer/Wood; Cambridge Edition\]](#)
- Online sources for early modern texts: <http://www.earlymoderntexts.com> [Note: Jonathan Bennett's translations into English are highly idiomatic!]

### Bibliography of Secondary Literature

- Alpina, Tommaso, "Knowing the Soul From Knowing Oneself: A Reading of the Prologue to Avicenna's *Kitab al-Nafs*."
- Black, "Avicenna on Self-Awareness and Knowing that One Knows"
- Blankenhorn, Bernhard. "How the Early Albertus Magnus Transformed Augustinian Interiority."
- Brachtendorf, Johannes, *The Structure of the Mind in Augustine*
- Brower-Toland, Susan, "Ockham on the Scope and Limits of Consciousness"
- Brower-Toland, Susan, "Medieval Approaches to Consciousness: Ockham and Chatton"
- Brower-Toland, Susan, "Olivi on Consciousness and Self-Knowledge: the Phenomenology, Metaphysics, and Epistemology of Mind's Reflexivity."
- Cary, Phillip, [Augustine's Invention of the Inner Self: The Legacy of a Christian Platonist](#) (available through the library website)
- Cory, Therese, *Aquinas on Human Self-Knowledge*
- Cory, Therese, "Reflexivity of Incorporeal Acts as Source of Freedom and Subjectivity in Aquinas"

- Cory, Therese Scarpelli. "Augustine and Aquinas on Diachronically Unified Consciousness."
- De Libera, Alain, *Archéologie du sujet*. 3 vols.
- Emilsson, Emil, *Plotinus on Intellect*
- Gregoric, Pavel, and Christian Pfeiffer, "Grasping Aristotle's Intellect"
- Hasse, *Avicenna's De anima in the Latin West*
- Kaukua, Jari, *Self-Awareness in Islamic Thought: Avicenna and Beyond*
- Kaukua, Jari, and Tomas Ekenberg, eds., [Subjectivity and Selfhood in Medieval and Early Modern Philosophy](#)
- Kitcher, Patricia, *Kant's Thinker*
- Lagouanère, Jérôme, *Intériorité et réflexivité dans la pensée de saint Augustin*
- Lloyd, A.C. "Nosce teipsum and conscientia."
- López-Farjeat, Luis Xavier. "Self-Awareness (Al-Shu'ûr Bi-Al-Dhât) in Human and Non-Human Animals in Avicenna's Psychological Writings."
- Marmura, "Avicenna's Flying Man in Context"
- Martin, Christopher. J. "Self-Knowledge and Cognitive Ascent: Thomas Aquinas and Peter Olivi on the KK-Thesis."
- Menn, Stephen, [Descartes and Augustine](#)
- Oh, Sonja, "Ockham on the Possibility of Self-Knowledge: Knowing Acts without Knowing Subjects," *Vivarium* 52 (2014): 220-40.
- Oh, Sonja, and Perler, Dominik, *Selbstbezug und Selbstwissen: Texte zu einer mittelalterlichen Debatte*
- Pasnau, *Aquinas on Human Nature*, ch. 11
- Remes, Pauliina, and Sihvola, eds., *Ancient Philosophy of the Self*
- Remes, Pauliina, *Plotinus on Self: The Philosophy of the We*
- Renz, Ursula, [Self-Knowledge: A History \(OXFORD PHILOSOPHICAL CONCEPTS\)](#)
- Rode, Christian, "Der Begriff der inneren Erfahrung bei Petrus Johannis Olivi"
- Rode, Christian, "Peter of John Olivi on Representation and Self-Representation"
- Sorabji, Richard. *Self: Ancient and Modern Insights about Individuality, Life, and Death*
- Thiel, Udo, [The Early Modern Subject](#)
- Williams, Bernard, *Descartes. The Project of Pure Inquiry*

## SCHEDULE

### WEEK 1. August 27 -- Course Intro. First steps

- Plato, *Alcibiades I* 127d-134b [SCAN];
- Aristotle, *De anima* 3.4 [SCAN]

### WEEK 2. September 3 -- Augustine

- Augustine, *De Trinitate*, bks. 9-10, as well as bk 14, ch. 5 (no. 7) to ch. 7 (no. 10).
- Sec. Lit. (pick one):
  - For an extended commentary on bks 9-10: Johannes Brachtendorf, *The Structure of the Mind according to Augustine: Self-reflection and Knowledge of God in De Trinitate*, trans. Aaron Looney [scan], ch IV and ch VI (pp. 118-47 and 162-84)
  - For the Augustinian concept of interiority in historical context: Phillip Cary, *Augustine's Invention of the Inner Self*, last 2 sections of ch. 9, all of ch. 10, and the first two pages of the conclusion (pp. 121-41--available through Hesburgh Library website)

### WEEK 3. September 10 -- Avicenna

- Avicenna, *Psychology from The Cure* (= *Liber de anima* or *Kitab al-Nafs*), trans. McGinnis, chs. 1.1 and 5.7 only, i.e., pp. 175-79 and 205-209 [scan]
- Sec. Lit.:
  - Kaukua, *Self-Awareness in Islamic Philosophy*, chs. 1-4
  - Hasse, Avicenna's *De anima* in the Latin West, pp. 80-92 [scan]
  - Optional: Marmura, "Avicenna's Flying Man in Context" [scan]; Black, "Self-Awareness and Knowing That One Knows [scan]"

### WEEK 4. September 17 -- Aquinas and the Aristotelian Tradition

- Aquinas, *De veritate*, q. 10, aa. 8 (scan; for Latin see <https://dhsprory.org/thomas/QDdeVer10.htm>)
- Aquinas, *Summa theologiae*, Ia, q. 87, a.1 (scan; for Latin see <https://dhsprory.org/thomas/summa/FP/FP087.html#FPQ87OUTP1>)
- Aquinas, *Commentary on De anima* bk. 3, lect. 9 (scan in English; scan in Latin where the numbering is bk. 3, c. 3)
- Aquinas, *Commentary on the Metaphysics* 12.8, nos. 2539-2541 only (English/Latin: <https://dhsprory.org/thomas/Metaphysics12.htm#8>)
- Sec. Lit. (different accounts):
  - Therese Cory, *Aquinas on Human Self-Knowledge*, chs. 4-6 (see book or scan)
  - Robert Pasnau, *Aquinas on Human Nature*, ch. 11 (scan)
  - Optional: Cory, ch. 1 (on background to medieval debate)

### WEEK 5. September 24 -- Aquinas, cont., and Olivi

- (On moral self-knowledge) Aquinas, *De veritate*, q. 10, a. 9; Aquinas, *Summa theologiae*, Ia, q. 87, aa. 2, continued in the scans from last week
- Olivi, *In Sententiarum* II, qq. 76 & 79, trans. Brower-Toland [scan]
- Sec. Lit.:
  - Susan Brower-Toland, "Olivi on Consciousness and Self-Knowledge: the Phenomenology, Metaphysics, and Epistemology of Mind's Reflexivity" (scan)
  - Christopher J. Martin, "Self-Knowledge and Cognitive Ascent: Thomas Aquinas and Peter Olivi on the *KK-Thesis*" (scan)

### WEEK 6. October 1 -- Ockham vs. Chatton.

- William of Ockham, *Ordinatio, Prologue*, q. 1, a. 1, selections, trans. Brower-Toland [scan]
- William of Ockham, *Reportatio* 2, 17, trans. Brower-Toland
- William of Ockham, *Quodlibet* 1, q. 15, and *Quodlibet* 2, q. 12, trans. Freddoso [scan]
- Walter Chatton, *Reportatio et Lectura*, Prologue, Q. 2, a.5, trans. Brower-Toland [Scan]
- Sec. Lit.:
  - Susan Brower-Toland, "Medieval Approaches to Consciousness: Ockham and Chatton," *Philosophical Imprint* 12 (2012): 1-29.
  - Sonja Schierbaum, "Ockham on the Possibility of Self-Knowledge: Knowing Acts without Knowing Subjects," *Vivarium* 52 (2014): 220-240.

### WEEK 7. October 8 -- Introduction to Early Modern Philosophy: Descartes' Cogito

- Descartes, *Meditation* II [scan]
- Sec. Lit.:
  - Bernard Williams, *Descartes. The Project of Pure Inquiry*, London: Routledge, 2005 [1978], Ch. 2 ("Ergo and Sum"), 57-86. [scan]
  - Alison Simmons, "Cartesian Consciousness Reconsidered", *Philosophers' Imprint* 12 (2) (2012): 1-21.
  - Background: Larry Jorgensen, "Seventeenth-Century Theories of Consciousness", *Stanford Encyclopedia*, 2014

### October 15 [FALL BREAK, NO CLASS]

[Start developing topic / outline for paper and meet to discuss in ensuing weeks]

### WEEK 8. October 22 -- Locke (and Hume) on Consciousness and Reflection

- Locke, *Essay* I.2; II.1-2
- Hume, *Enquiry*, Ch. 2 ("Of the Origin of Ideas")
- Sec. Lit.:
  - Shelley Weinberg, "The Coherence of Consciousness in Locke's 'Essay'," *History of Philosophy Quarterly* 25(1) (2008): 21-39.

- Udo Thiel, "Hume's Notions of Consciousness and Reflection in Context," *British Journal for the History of Philosophy* 2(2) (1994): 75-115

### **WEEK 9. October 29 -- Locke (and Hume) on Personal Identity**

- Locke, *Essay*, II. 27
- Hume, *Treatise*, Book I.iv.6
- Sec. Lit.:
  - Udo Thiel, *The Early Modern Subject*, Ch. 3 ("Locke on Identity, Consciousness, and Self-Consciousness") and Ch. 4 ("Locke on Personal Identity: Consciousness, Memory, and Self-Concern") (available through Hesburgh Library website)
  - Optional: Udo Thiel, *The Early Modern Subject*, Ch. 12 ("12. Hume and the Belief in Personal identity")
  - Optional: Ruth Böker, "Locke on Personal Identity: A Response to the Problems of his Predecessors." *Journal of the History of Philosophy* 55 (2017): 407-34.

### **WEEK 10. November 5th -- Leibniz on Apperception, Reflection, and Self-Consciousness**

- Leibniz, *New Essays*, Preface [scan]
- Leibniz, *Monadology* §§1-3; §§ 7-15 [scan]
- Sec. Lit.:
  - Rocco Gennaro, "Leibniz on consciousness and self-consciousness". In: Charles Huenemann & Rocco Gennaro (eds.), *New Essays on the Rationalists*. Oxford University Press (1999): 353-71 [scan]
  - Alison Simmons, "Leibnizian Consciousness Reconsidered," *Studia Leibnitiana* 43(2) (2011): 196-215.

### **WEEK 11. November 12th -- Avicenna again. Luis Lopez-Farjeat, guest lecture on Avicenna and the self-consciousness of animals**

- Readings: TBD

### **WEEK 12. November 19th -- Kant on "I think" and Transcendental Self-Consciousness**

- Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, Transcendental Deduction (B-Edition) (§§15-20; §§24-25)
- Sec. Lit. (different accounts):
  - Patricia Kitcher, "Kant on Self-Consciousness," *Philosophical Review* 108(3) (1999): 345-386
  - Wolfgang Carl, "Apperception and spontaneity," *International Journal of Philosophical Studies* 5(2) (1997): 147-163
  - Tobias Rosefeldt, "Kant's Self: Real Entity and Logical Identity," in: H. Glock (ed.), *Strawson and Kant*, Oxford: Oxford University Press (2003): 141–154
  - Optional: Katharina Kraus, *The Nature of Inner Experience* (Book Manuscript), Ch. 3 ("The Unity of Self-Consciousness and the Thinking Subject")

### **WEEK 13. November 26th -- Kant on the Empirical Self and Inner Experience**

- Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*
  - The Refutation of Idealism (B-Edition)
  - First and Third Paralogism (A-Edition)
  - Appendix to the Dialectic (Part II: “On the final aim of the natural dialectic of human reason”) (A669/B697-A673/B701; A683/B710-A684/B712)
- Sec. Lit. (different accounts):
  - Andrew Chignell, “Can’t Kant Cognize Himself? Or, a Problem for (Almost) Every Interpretation of the Refutation of Idealism,” In: Anil Gomes and Andrew Stephenson (eds.), *Kant and the Philosophy of Mind: Perception, Reason, and the Self*, OUP [scan]
  - Katharina Kraus, *The Nature of Inner Experience* (Book Manuscript), Ch. 5 (“The Idea of the Soul as the Guiding Thread of Inner Experience”)

### **WEEK 14. December 3rd -- The Moral Dimension of Self-Consciousness and Final Discussion**

- Ursula Renz, “Socratic Self-Knowledge in Early Modern Philosophy,” In: U. Renz (ed.) *Self-Knowledge*, OUP (2017): 146-63.